

**Letter to the Editor**

**Nonexistence of Best Rational  
Approximations on Subsets**

CHARLES B. DUNHAM

*Computer Science Department, University of Western Ontario, London, Canada*

*Communicated by E. W. Cheney*

Let  $Y$  be a compact subset of  $[0, 1]$  and  $C(Y)$  the space of continuous functions on  $Y$ . For  $g \in C(Y)$  define

$$\|g\|_Y = \sup\{|g(x)| : x \in Y\}, \quad \|g\| = \|g\|_{[0,1]}.$$

Let  $R_m^n[0, 1]$  be the family of ratios  $p/q$ ,  $p$  a polynomial of degree  $\leq n$ ,  $q$  a polynomial of degree  $\leq m$ ,  $q(x) > 0$  for  $0 \leq x \leq 1$ . The Chebyshev approximation problem on  $Y$  is for given  $f \in C(Y)$  to find an element  $r^*$  of  $R_m^n[0, 1]$  such that  $\|f - r\|_Y$  is minimized. Such an element  $r^*$  is called best to  $f$  on  $Y$ .

DEFINITION. An element  $r$  of  $R_m^n[0, 1]$  is called *degenerate* if it can be expressed as  $p/q$ ,  $p$  of degree  $< n$ ,  $q$  of degree  $< m$ .

In [2] it is shown that if the best approximation to  $f$  on  $[0, 1]$  is nondegenerate, then best approximations exist to  $f$  on all sufficiently dense subsets  $Y$ . We now consider the case where the best approximation  $r^*$  to  $f$  on  $[0, 1]$  is degenerate. A point  $x$  is called an *extremum* of  $f - r^*$  if

$$|f(x) - r^*(x)| = \|f - r^*\|.$$

If the set of extrema of  $f - r^*$  is a union of closed intervals of positive length, it is readily seen that all sufficiently dense subsets  $Y$  of  $[0, 1]$  contain a set of (alternating) extrema of  $f - r^*$  and so  $r^*$  is best on  $Y$ . We consider the more typical case where endpoints are extrema and the extrema are isolated.

DEFINITION. Let  $X_k \subset [0, 1]$ . We say  $\{X_k\} \rightarrow [0, 1]$  if for any  $x \in [0, 1]$  there is a sequence  $\{x_k\} \rightarrow x$ ,  $x_k \in X_k$ .

THEOREM. Let  $r^*$  be a degenerate element of  $R_m^n[0, 1]$ . Let the set of extrema of  $f - r^*$  be nowhere dense and an endpoint be an extremum. Then

there exists a sequence  $\{X_k\} \rightarrow [0, 1]$  such that no best approximation exists to  $f$  on  $X_k$ .

*Proof.* Assume without loss of generality that 0 is an extremum and  $f(0) - r^*(0) > 0$ . Let  $e = f(0) - r^*(0) = \|f - r^*\|$ ,

$$X_k = \{0\} \cup \{x : |f(x) - r^*(x)| \leq e - 1/k\}, \quad 1/k < e.$$

Let  $r^*$  be represented by  $p^*/q^*$ ,  $p^*$  of degree  $n - 1$ ;  $q^*$  of degree  $m - 1$ ,  $q^*(x) > 0$  for  $0 \leq x \leq 1$ ,  $q^*(0) = 1$ . Define

$$r_j(x) = r^*(x) + [e/j]/[x + 1/j] q^*(x).$$

As  $r^*$  is degenerate,  $r_j \in R_m^n[0, 1]$ .

Denote the norm on  $X_k$  by  $\|\cdot\|_k$ . We have  $r_j(0) = f(0)$  and  $r_j(x) \rightarrow r^*(x)$  uniformly for  $x \in X_k \sim \{0\}$ , hence  $\{\|f - r_j\|_k\} \rightarrow e - 1/k$ . Let  $r^*$  have alternating degree  $l$  then there exist  $x_1^k < \dots < x_l^k \in X_k$  on which  $f - r^*$  attains alternately  $-e + 1/k$  and  $e - 1/k$ . Let  $x_0 = 0$ . By the generalized lemma of de la Vallée-Poussin [1, p. 226], we have for  $r \in R_m^n[0, 1] \sim r^*$ ,

$$\begin{aligned} \max\{|f(x_i^k) - r(x_i^k)| : i = 0, \dots, l\} &> \min\{|f(x_i^k) - r^*(x_i^k)| : i = 0, \dots, l\} \\ &= e - 1/k. \end{aligned}$$

Since  $f(0) - r^*(0) = e$ , there is no  $r \in R_m^n[0, 1]$  with  $\|f - r\|_k = e - 1/k$ , that is, no best approximation exists on  $X_k$ .

The set  $X_k$  of the theorem is infinite. We are also interested in finite sets with similar properties. If we let

$$Y_k = [X_k \cap \{m/2^k\}] \cup \left[ \bigcup_{j=1}^k \{x_1^j, \dots, x_l^j\} \right],$$

then  $Y_k$  is a finite set,  $Y_k \subset Y_{k+1}$ ,  $\{Y_k\} \rightarrow [0, 1]$ , and best approximations do not exist on  $Y_k$  by identical arguments.

It should be noted that the results (and proof) of this paper can be extended to approximation by other alternating families, in particular to exponential sums.

#### REFERENCES

1. C. B. DUNHAM, Chebyshev approximation with respect to a weight function, *J. Approximation Theory* **2** (1969), 223-232.
2. C. B. DUNHAM, Varisolvent chebyshev approximation on subsets, in "Approximation Theory" (G. G. Lorentz, ed.), pp. 337-340, Academic Press, New York, 1973.